## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

NICHOLE BEINER,

Plaintiff,

-against-

ANGÉLICQUE M. MORENO, Chair of the State of New York Grievance Committee for the Second, Eleventh, and Thirteenth Judicial Districts, in her official capacity; DAVID W. CHANDLER, Chief Attorney of the State of New York Grievance Committee for the Second, Eleventh, and Thirteenth Judicial Districts, in his official capacity; and HECTOR D. LaSALLE, Presiding Justice of the Second Judicial Department of the Appellate Division of the Supreme Court of the State of New York, in his official capacity,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 24 Civ. 08600

## DECLARATION OF ZOE SALZMAN, ESQ.

I, ZOE SALZMAN, under penalty of perjury, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1746, declare that the following is true and correct:

- 1. I am an attorney licensed to practice law in the State of New York and admitted to practice in this Court. I am partner at the law firm Emery Celli Brinckerhoff Abady Ward & Maazel, LLP, lawyers for Nichole Beiner in this case.
- 2. I submit this declaration in support of Ms. Beiner's opposition to Defendants Cuomo's motion to stay the proceedings or, in the alternative, dismiss the complaint in the above captioned matter.
- 3. In a letter dated September 4, 2024, then-Chair of the New York Grievance

  Committee for the Second, Eleventh, and Thirteenth Judicial Districts Andrea Bonina denied Ms.

  Beiner access to the letter of admonition that the Committee issued to Professor Maclin and all

materials considered and created during the Committee's investigation of Professor Maclin. This letter was sent to and received by our office.

4. A true and correct copy of this letter denying Ms. Beiner access to the

Committee's records is attached to this declaration as Exhibit 1.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Dated: New York, New York June 18, 2025



## Exhibit 1



ANDREA E. BONINA, ESQ. CHAIR

## STATE OF NEW YORK GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE FOR THE SECOND, ELEVENTH AND THIRTEENTH JUDICIAL DISTRICTS

RENAISSANCE PLAZA 335 ADAMS STREET – SUITE 2400 BROOKLYN, NEW YORK 11201-3745 (718) 923-6300 CATHERINE A. SHERIDAN COURTNY OSTERLING ACTING CHIEF COUNSEL

MARK F. DEWAN
DEPUTY CHIEF COUNSEL

SUSAN KORENBERG SUSAN B. MASTER DAVID W. CHANDLER SARA MUSTAFA LISA M. McCABE LAUREN R. COOPER CONOR HARTNETT MICHAEL D'AMBROSIO STAFF COUNSEL

September 4, 2024

BY FIRST CLASS MAIL AND EMAIL PERSONAL & CONFIDENTIAL

Hal Lieberman, Esq. & Zoe Salzman, Esq.
Emery Celli Brinckerhoff Abady Ward & Maazel, LLP
600 Fifth Avenue, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor
New York, NY 10020
<a href="mailto:hlieberman@ecbawm.com">hlieberman@ecbawm.com</a>
zsalzman@ecbawm.com

Re: File No. K-458-23

Dear Mr. Lieberman and Ms. Salzman:

This shall acknowledge receipt of your letter dated August 12, 2024, requesting "the Committee provide all the materials considered and created" during the investigation of the above-referenced matter, including a copy of the admonition issued to the subject-attorney, pursuant to Civil Rights Corps. v. LaSalle.

The materials you requested were not included in the declaratory relief issued under *Civil Rights Corps. v. LaSalle*, 21-cv-9128, 2024 WL 3496607 (S.D.N.Y. July 22, 2024). That decision, moreover, is presently pending appeal. Accordingly, access to the records and/or proceedings sought by your request is governed by Judiciary Law § 90(10) and, therefore, the matters remain sealed and deemed private and confidential, subject to an unsealing order premised upon a showing of good cause.

Very truly yours,

Andrea E. Bonina

Chair

AEB/md